



EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT

2009 - 2014

---

*Plenary sitting*

---

**A7-0009/2014**

7.1.2014

# REPORT

on the EU Roadmap against homophobia and discrimination on grounds  
of sexual orientation and gender identity  
(2013/2183(INI))

Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs

Rapporteur: Ulrike Lunacek

RR\1014676EN.doc

PE521.599v02-00

**EN**

*United in diversity*

**EN**

**CONTENTS**

	<b>Page</b>
MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION .....	3
EXPLANATORY STATEMENT.....	13
RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE .....	18

## MOTION FOR A EUROPEAN PARLIAMENT RESOLUTION

### on the EU Roadmap against homophobia and discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity (2013/2183(INI))

*The European Parliament,*

- having regard to Article 2 of the Treaty on European Union,
- having regard to Articles 8 and 10 of the Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union,
- having regard to the Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union and in particular its Article 21,
- having regard to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms,
- having regard to Recommendation CM/Rec(2010)5 of the Committee of Ministers of the Council of Europe to member states on measures to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity, adopted on 31 March 2010,
- having regard to the Communication from the Commission entitled a ‘Strategy for the effective implementation of the Charter of Fundamental Rights by the European Union’ (COM(2010)0573),
- having regard to the 2012 Commission Report on the Application of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights (COM(2013)0271), and to the accompanying staff working documents,
- having regard to the proposal for a Council directive on implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation (COM(2008)0426) and to its position of 2 April 2009 on that proposal<sup>1</sup>,
- having regard to the guidelines to promote and protect the enjoyment of all human rights by lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex (LGBTI) persons adopted by the Council of the European Union at its meeting of 24 June 2013,
- having regard to the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights report of November 2010 on homophobia, transphobia and discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity,
- having regard to the results of the European Union lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender survey carried out by the Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) and published on 17 May 2013,

---

<sup>1</sup> OJ C 241 E, 8.10.2009, p. 68.

- having regard to the FRA opinion of 1 October 2013 on the situation of equality in the European Union 10 years on from initial implementation of the equality directives,
  - having regard to its resolution of 24 May 2012 on the fight against homophobia in Europe<sup>1</sup>,
  - having regard to its resolution of 12 December 2012 on the situation of fundamental rights in the European Union (2010-2011)<sup>2</sup>,
  - having regard to its resolution of 14 March 2013 on strengthening the fight against racism, xenophobia and hate crime<sup>3</sup>,
  - having regard to Rule 48 of its Rules of Procedure,
  - having regard to the report of the Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs and the opinion of the Committee on Women’s Rights and Gender Equality (A7-0009/2014),
- A. whereas the European Union is founded on the values of respect for human dignity, freedom, democracy, equality, the rule of law and respect for human rights, including the rights of persons belonging to minorities;
- B. whereas in defining and implementing its policies and activities, the European Union aims to combat discrimination based on sex, racial or ethnic origin, religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation;
- C. whereas in June 2013 the Council of the European Union adopted strong guidelines to promote and protect the enjoyment of all human rights by LGBTI persons outside the European Union, and should ensure that they are protected effectively inside the EU;
- D. whereas the European Union already coordinates its action through comprehensive policies in the field of equality and non-discrimination through the ‘Framework strategy for non-discrimination and equal opportunities for all’, in the field of gender equality through the ‘Strategy for equality between women and men 2010-2015’, in the field of disability through the ‘European Disability Strategy 2010-2020’, and in the field of equality for Roma persons through the ‘EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020’;
- E. whereas in its ‘Strategy for the effective implementation of the Charter of Fundamental Rights by the European Union’, the Commission has acknowledged the necessity of developing individual policies concerning certain specific fundamental rights on the basis of the Treaties;

---

<sup>1</sup> Texts adopted, P7\_TA(2012)0222.

<sup>2</sup> Texts adopted, P7\_TA(2012)0500.

<sup>3</sup> Texts adopted, P7\_TA(2013)0090.

- F. whereas in the 2013 EU LGBT survey, the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA) found that across the EU in the year preceding the survey one in two LGBT respondents felt discriminated against or harassed on grounds of sexual orientation, one in three were discriminated against when accessing goods or services, one in four were physically attacked, and one in five were discriminated against in employment or occupation;
- G. whereas the FRA recommended that the EU and Member States develop action plans promoting respect for LGBT persons and protection of their fundamental rights;
- H. whereas in May 2013 11 Equality Ministers<sup>1</sup> called on the Commission to issue a comprehensive EU policy for LGBT equality, and 10 Member States<sup>2</sup> have already adopted or are discussing similar policies at national and regional levels;
- I. whereas the European Parliament has asked 10 times for a comprehensive European Union policy instrument for equality on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity;

### ***General considerations***

- 1. Strongly condemns any discrimination on the basis of sexual orientation and gender identity, and strongly regrets that the fundamental rights of lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex (LGBTI) people are not yet always fully upheld in the European Union;
- 2. Believes that the European Union currently lacks a comprehensive policy to protect the fundamental rights of LGBTI people;
- 3. Acknowledges that the responsibility to protect fundamental rights lies jointly with the European Commission and Member States; calls on the Commission to use its competences to the fullest extent, including facilitating the exchange of good practices among Member States; calls on Member States to fulfil their obligations under EU law and under the Council of Europe Recommendation on measures to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation or gender identity;

### ***Roadmap contents***

- 4. Calls on the European Commission, Member States and relevant agencies to work jointly on a comprehensive multiannual policy to protect the fundamental rights of LGBTI people, i.e. a roadmap, a strategy or an action plan featuring the themes and objectives hereunder;

#### **A. Horizontal actions to implement the Roadmap**

---

<sup>1</sup> Austria, Belgium, Croatia, Denmark, Finland, France, Italy, Luxembourg, Malta, the Netherlands, Sweden.

<sup>2</sup> Belgium, Croatia, France, Germany, Italy, Malta, the Netherlands, Portugal, Spain, United Kingdom.

- (i) The Commission should work to secure existing rights throughout its work and across all domains in which it is competent by mainstreaming issues linked to the fundamental rights of LGBTI people in all relevant work – for instance when drafting future policies and proposals or monitoring the implementation of EU law;
- (ii) The Commission should facilitate, coordinate and monitor the exchange of good practice among Member States via the open method of coordination;
- (iii) Relevant European Union agencies, including the European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights (FRA), the European Institute for Gender Equality (EIGE), the European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions (Eurofound), the European Police College (CEPOL), the European Union's Judicial Cooperation Unit (Eurojust), the European Judicial Network (EJN) and the European Asylum Support Office (EASO), should mainstream issues related to sexual orientation and gender identity in their work, and continue to provide the Commission and Member States with evidence-based advice on the fundamental rights of LGBTI people;
- (iv) The Commission and Member States should be encouraged to regularly collect relevant and comparable data on the situation of LGBTI persons in the EU together with relevant agencies and Eurostat, while fully respecting EU data protection rules;
- (v) Together with relevant agencies, the Commission and Member States should encourage training and capacity-building for national equality bodies, national human rights institutions and other organisations tasked with the promotion and protection of the fundamental rights of LGBTI persons;
- (vi) Together with relevant agencies, the Commission and Member States should seek to make citizens aware of the rights of LGBTI persons.

## **B. General provisions in the field of non-discrimination**

- (i) Member States should consolidate the existing EU legal framework by working to adopt the proposed directive on implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of religion or belief, disability, age or sexual orientation, including by clarifying the scope and associated costs of its provisions;
- (ii) The Commission, Member States and relevant agencies should pay particular attention to lesbian women's experience of multiple

discrimination and violence (both on grounds of sex and sexual orientation), and design and implement non-discrimination policies accordingly;

### **C. Non-discrimination in employment**

- (i) The Commission should include a specific focus on sexual orientation when monitoring the implementation of Directive 2000/78/EC establishing a general framework for equal treatment in employment and occupation, and on gender identity when monitoring the implementation of Directive 2006/54/EC on the implementation of the principle of equal opportunities and equal treatment of men and women in matters of employment and occupation,
- (ii) Together with the relevant agencies, the Commission should issue guidelines specifying that transgender and intersex persons are covered under 'sex' in Directive 2006/54/EC on the implementation of the principle of equal opportunities and equal treatment of men and women in matters of employment and occupation,
- (iii) Equality bodies should be encouraged to inform LGBTI persons, as well as trade unions and employer organisations, about their rights;

### **D. Non-discrimination in education**

- (i) The Commission should promote equality and non-discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity throughout its youth and education programmes,
- (ii) The Commission should facilitate the sharing of good practice in formal education, including teaching materials, anti-bullying and anti-discrimination policies, among Member States through the open method of coordination,
- (iii) The Commission should facilitate the sharing of good practice throughout Member States' youth and education sectors, including youth welfare services and social work, among Member States through the open method of coordination;

### **E. Non-discrimination in health**

- (i) The Commission should place LGBTI health concerns within

relevant wider strategic health policies, including access to health care, equality in health, and the EU's global voice in health-related matters,

- (ii) The Commission should continue working within the World Health Organisation to withdraw gender identity disorders from the list of mental and behavioural disorders and to ensure a non-pathologising reclassification in the negotiations on the 11th version of the International Classification of Diseases (ICD-11),
- (iii) The Commission should support Member States in the training of health professionals,
- (iv) The Commission and Member States should undertake research on health issues specific to LGBTI persons,
- (v) Member States should take account of LGBTI people within national health plans and policies, ensuring training curricula, health policies and health surveys take specific LGBTI health issues into account,
- (vi) Member States should introduce or review legal gender recognition procedures so they fully respect transgender people's right to dignity and bodily integrity;

#### **F. Non-discrimination in goods and services**

- (i) The Commission should include a specific focus on access to goods and services by transgender persons when monitoring the implementation of Directive 2004/113/EC on implementing the principle of equal treatment between men and women in the access to and supply of goods and services;

#### **G. Action specific to transgender and intersex persons**

- (i) The Commission should ensure gender identity is included among prohibited grounds of discrimination in any future equality legislation, including any recasts,
- (ii) The Commission should mainstream issues specific to transgender and intersex people throughout the relevant EU



policies, mirroring the approach adopted in the Gender Equality Strategy,

- (iii) Member States should ensure equality bodies are informed and trained about the rights of, and specific issues pertaining to, transgender and intersex people;
- (iv) The Commission, Member States and relevant agencies should address the current lack of knowledge, research and relevant legislation on the human rights of intersex people;

## **H. Citizenship, families and freedom of movement**

- (i) The Commission should produce guidelines to ensure that Directive 2004/38/EC on the right of Union citizens and their family members to move and reside freely within the territory of the Member States, and Directive 2003/86/EC on the right to family reunification, are implemented so as to ensure respect for all forms of families legally recognised under Member States' national laws,
- (ii) The Commission should, as a priority, make proposals for the mutual recognition of the effects of all civil status documents across the EU, including registered partnerships, marriages and legal gender recognition, in order to reduce discriminatory legal and administrative barriers for citizens and their families who exercise their right to free movement,
- (iii) The Commission and Member States should study whether restrictions in place for the change of civil status and identity documents for transgender people harms their ability to enjoy their right to free movement,
- (iv) Member States which have adopted legislation on cohabitation, registered partnerships or marriage for same-sex couples should recognise similar provisions adopted by other Member States;

## **I. Freedom of assembly and expression**

- (i) Member States should ensure that rights to freedom of expression and assembly are guaranteed, particularly with regard to pride marches and similar events, by ensuring these events take place lawfully and by guaranteeing the effective

protection of participants,

- (ii) Member States should refrain from adopting laws and reconsider existing laws which restrict freedom of expression in relation to sexual orientation and gender identity,
- (iii) The Commission and the Council of the European Union should consider that Member States adopting laws to restrict freedom of expression in relation to sexual orientation and gender identity breach the values on which the European Union is founded, and react accordingly;

#### **J. Hate speech and hate crime**

- (i) The Commission should monitor and provide assistance to the Member States with regard to issues specific to sexual orientation, gender identity and gender expression when implementing Directive 2012/29/EU on the rights, support and protection of victims of crime, in particular when crimes are committed with a bias or discriminatory motive which could be related to the personal characteristics of the victims,
- (ii) The Commission should propose a recast of the Council Framework Decision on combating certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia by means of criminal law including other forms of bias crime and incitement to hatred, including on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity,
- (iii) Together with relevant agencies, the Commission should facilitate the exchange of good practice among Member States pertaining to the training and education of police forces, prosecution services, judges and victim support services,
- (iv) The Fundamental Rights Agency should assist Member States in improving their collection of comparable data about homophobic and transphobic hate crime,
- (v) Member States should register and investigate hate crimes against LGBTI people, and adopt criminal legislation prohibiting incitement to hatred on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity;

## **K. Asylum**

- (i) Together with the European Asylum Support Office (EASO) and relevant agencies, and within the remit of existing EU legislation and jurisprudence, the Commission should include specific issues linked to sexual orientation and gender identity in the implementation and monitoring of asylum legislation, including Directive 2013/32/EU on common procedures for granting and withdrawing international protection, and Directive 2011/95/EU on standards for the qualification of third-country nationals or stateless persons as beneficiaries of international protection,
- (ii) Together with relevant agencies, the Commission and Member States should ensure that asylum professionals, including interviewers and interpreters, receive adequate training – including existing training – to handle issues relating specifically to LGBTI persons,
- (iii) Together with the EASO and in cooperation with the European External Action Service, the Commission and Member States should ensure that the legal and social situation of LGBTI persons in countries of origin is documented systematically and that such information is made available to asylum decision-makers as part of Country of Origin Information (COI);

## **L. Enlargement and external action**

- (i) The Commission should continue its current monitoring of issues linked to sexual orientation and gender identity in accession countries,
- (ii) The Commission, the European External Action Service, the EU Special Representative for Human Rights and Member States should systematically use the Council Guidelines to promote and protect the enjoyment of all human rights by LGBTI persons, and maintain a unified position when responding to violations of these rights,
- (iii) The Commission and the European External Action Service should provide information obtained from EU delegations on the situation of LGBTI persons in third countries to the European Asylum Support Office and Member States;

5. Emphasises that this comprehensive policy must respect the competences of the European Union, of its agencies, and of Member States;

o  
o o

6. Instructs its President to forward this resolution to the Council of the European Union, the European Commission, the European External Action Service, the governments and parliaments of Member States, all agencies cited herein, and the Council of Europe.

## EXPLANATORY STATEMENT

The European Union has the obligation to combat discrimination when defining and implementing its activities (Article 10 TFEU). This obligation is materialised by existing comprehensive policies to combat discrimination based on sex (through the Strategy for equality between women and men 2010-2015), disability (through the European Disability Strategy 2010-2020), and affecting Roma people (through the EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020).

The European Parliament is of the opinion that such a comprehensive policy instrument is required to combat discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity. Since January 2011, it has made this request ten times in various resolutions, asking the European Commission to produce a roadmap against homophobia and discrimination on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity. This report sets out a draft canvas for such a comprehensive policy.

There are three strong legal, political and policy cases for such a roadmap. **Legally**, the European Union is required to combat discrimination when defining and implementing its policies and activities (Art. 10 TFEU), and prohibits discrimination on any ground (Art. 21 Charter of Fundamental Rights). This legal requirement is already materialised by comprehensive policies in the field of gender equality, disability and Roma integration; it must now be materialised for grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity.

**Politically**, support exists in the European Parliament as well as among Member States, eleven of which have officially called for such a roadmap in May 2013. The European Commission has responded that actions were already undertaken to ensure equality on grounds of sexual orientation and gender identity, but these actions are substandard compared to the comprehensive approach other groups benefit from. Furthermore, Member States are increasingly adopting similar plans at national level (Belgium, France, Italy, the Netherlands, United Kingdom, and under discussion in Latvia), as part of wider national equality plans (Croatia, Portugal), or at regional levels (Belgium, Germany, Spain).

Finally, **policy** data show such a roadmap is necessary. The LGBT survey published by the Agency for Fundamental Rights in 2013 indicates that **47% of LGBT people felt discriminated against or harassed in the last year**, with lesbian women (55%), young people (57%) and poorer LGBT people (52%) the most likely to be discriminated against; **26% were attacked or threatened with violence** because of their sexual orientation or gender identity (35% among transgender people); **only 10% feel confident enough to report discrimination to the police**, and only 22% report violence or harassment; **32% are discriminated against in housing, education, or when accessing healthcare, goods or services**; and **20% are discriminated against in employment or occupation** (29% among transgender people).

6.12.2013

## **OPINION OF THE COMMITTEE ON WOMEN'S RIGHTS AND GENDER EQUALITY**

for the Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs

on the EU Roadmap against homophobia and discrimination on grounds  
of sexual orientation and gender identity  
(2013/2183(INI))

Rapporteur: Minodora Cliveti

### **SUGGESTIONS**

The Committee on Women's Rights and Gender Equality calls on the Committee on Civil Liberties, Justice and Home Affairs, as the committee responsible, to incorporate the following suggestions in its motion for a resolution:

- A. whereas following case-law discrimination against transgender people is defined under gender equality legislation, but conceived as making up a social movement and in terms of civil society organisations, transgender people fall within the scope of the LGBTI (lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex) movement rather than the gender equality movement;
- B. whereas transgender people face severe discrimination based on gender in and outside the labour market, while in many Member States organisations involved in gender equality or dedicated to combating gender discrimination or handling individual complaints of gender discrimination are not accessible or do not possess adequate information and skills to further their interests or handle their complaints, and those involved in the judicial chain are not properly equipped or informed to handle cases of gender discrimination against transgender people;
  - 1. Is concerned that the rights and interests of transgender people are not being properly addressed either by civil society organisations or by equality bodies concerned with gender equality; calls on the Member States to specifically assign tasks regarding combating discrimination against transgender people to publicly

funded civil society organisations and equality bodies, and to ensure that those involved in the judicial chain are adequately equipped and informed to handle complaints of gender discrimination against transgender people;

2. Calls on the Commission and on Parliament's committees to mainstream issues concerning transgender people in their work in fields such as civil rights, healthcare, education and employment;
3. Emphasises the need to comply with and secure the principle of equality among people, irrespective of their gender, gender identity and gender expression, race or sexual orientation;
4. Highlights the invisibility of intersex people in European and national legislation and the lack of knowledge and research in this area; calls, in this context and in particular with respect to gender identity, for the stepping-up of efforts to make equality legislation work;
5. Calls on the Member States to ensure that LGBTI people are protected from homophobic hate speech and violence, and that same-sex partners enjoy the same respect, dignity and protection as prevail in the rest of society; emphasises the often negative public perception regarding LGBTI people and the role of the media in eliminating such perceptions; stresses the need to organise awareness-raising campaigns at national and European level regarding the rights of LGBTI people;
6. Stresses that lesbians often suffer from accumulated discrimination (both for being women and for being lesbians), and that actions in support of equality for LGBTI people must go hand in hand with actions for equality for women and girls in order to achieve equality, non-discrimination and a life free from violence for lesbians;
7. Highlights the need to promote policies and practices aimed at combating discrimination based on sexual orientation or gender identity, and to promote policies to foster diversity in the workplace, together with initiatives which encourage full inclusion of and respect for LGBTI staff in the work environment;
8. Stresses that reproductive choices and fertility services should be provided to LGBT persons in a non-discriminatory framework;
9. Underlines that sexual education must include non-discriminatory information and convey a positive view of LGBTI people, in order to underpin and protect in an effective manner the rights of young LGBTI people;
10. Underlines the need for the education and training of social and health care professionals to emphasise, by developing specific programmes as part of the relevant curricula, the importance of respecting the dignity of LGBTI people, as well as their specific healthcare needs and choices;
11. Calls on the Member States to take appropriate measures to ensure that transgender people in particular have effective access to appropriate gender reassignment services, including psychological, endocrinological and surgical expertise in the

field of transgender healthcare, without being subject to unreasonable requirements;

12. Condemns the forced sterilisation of transgender people, which still occurs in some Member States, and calls for an immediate end to this breach of human rights;
13. Calls on the Member States to take action to promote respect for and inclusion of LGBTI people at school, and to foster objective knowledge on issues concerning sexual orientation, gender identity and gender expression in schools and other educational settings; expresses concern that young LGBTI people and those perceived as LGBTI are at an increased risk of being bullied; stresses the need to build a safe environment for all young people, irrespective of their gender, race or sexual orientation;
14. Underlines the importance of recognising the civil rights of LGBTI people without discrimination on grounds of their sexual orientation or gender identity; urges the Member States to recognise, in accordance with EU rules, all forms of marriage, partnership and parenthood contracted elsewhere by those resident or working within their borders, and calls on the Commission to take action against Member States that fail to comply;
15. Invites the Member States to reflect on ways to adapt their family law to today's changing family patterns and forms, and to include the possibility for children to have more than two parents (or legal guardians), as this would open up possibilities of increased recognition for rainbow families and LGBT families, as well as for recomposed families;
16. Calls on the Member States to ensure access for single and lesbian women to fertility treatment and assisted reproduction;
17. Underlines the need to respect the right of freedom of expression in practice by safeguarding the possibility of receiving and imparting information on issues related to sexual orientation and gender identity by means of all forms of expression, including the press, publications, oral and written statements, the arts and the media; stresses the need to respect the freedom of peaceful assembly and association of all LGBTI people; considers that local and regional authorities should therefore facilitate efforts by LGBTI organisations to organise events such as 'Pride parades', since these can raise public awareness on LGBTI issues and empower LGBTI people;
18. Highlights the significant lack of data and research on the problems facing LGBTI people, the scale of the problems and the steps being taken to address them; points out that such information is crucial for developing appropriate policy and prioritising actions, and calls on the EU and the Member States to address these problems and to act in consequence;
19. Encourages the Member States to ensure that relevant quantitative data in the form of regular surveys concerning the prevalence of abuse and victimisation of LGBTI people are gathered and analysed;



## RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE

<b>Date adopted</b>	5.12.2013
<b>Result of final vote</b>	+: 11 -: 4 0: 0
<b>Members present for the final vote</b>	Edit Bauer, Marije Cornelissen, Edite Estrela, Mikael Gustafsson, Mary Honeyball, Livia Járóka, Astrid Lulling, Elisabeth Morin-Chartier, Raúl Romeva i Rueda, Marc Tarabella, Britta Thomsen, Marina Yannakoudakis, Inês Cristina Zuber
<b>Substitute(s) present for the final vote</b>	Izaskun Bilbao Barandica, Minodora Cliveti

## RESULT OF FINAL VOTE IN COMMITTEE

<b>Date adopted</b>	17.12.2013
<b>Result of final vote</b>	+:                40 -:                2 0:                 6
<b>Members present for the final vote</b>	Jan Philipp Albrecht, Edit Bauer, Arkadiusz Tomasz Bratkowski, Philip Claeys, Carlos Coelho, Agustín Díaz de Mera García Consuegra, Ioan Enciu, Tanja Fajon, Monika Flašíková Beňová, Kinga Gál, Kinga Göncz, Sylvie Guillaume, Anna Hedh, Salvatore Iacolino, Livia Járóka, Teresa Jiménez-Becerril Barrio, Timothy Kirkhope, Baroness Sarah Ludford, Monica Luisa Macovei, Svetoslav Hristov Malinov, Véronique Mathieu Houillon, Anthea McIntyre, Nuno Melo, Roberta Metsola, Claude Moraes, Georgios Papanikolaou, Carmen Romero López, Judith Sargentini, Birgit Sippel, Csaba Sógor, Renate Sommer, Nils Torvalds, Wim van de Camp, Axel Voss, Renate Weber, Auke Zijlstra
<b>Substitute(s) present for the final vote</b>	Cornelis de Jong, Mariya Gabriel, Ana Gomes, Wolfgang Kreissl- Dörfler, Jean Lambert, Ulrike Lunacek, Jan Mulder, Raül Romeva i Rueda, Salvador Sedó i Alabart, Marie-Christine Vergiat, Janusz Wojciechowski
<b>Substitute(s) under Rule 187(2) present for the final vote</b>	Leonardo Domenici